

McClellanville Architectural / Design Review Board Meeting

AGENDA

January 19, 2021

The purpose of the McClellanville Architectural Review Board is to ensure that the historic integrity of significant or contributing properties is preserved and that the integrity of the village's historic character is not compromised by construction or alterations to noncontributing properties.

Join Zoom Meeting

<https://us02web.zoom.us/j/86451428081>

Meeting ID: 864 5142 8081

One tap mobile Call In: 1 929 205 6099

Bobby looked at it, motion to approve Bobby second
Mary

- 1. Approve minutes of combined November/December meeting on December 8, 2020.

- 2. ARB consideration of Window World application for installation of 28 replacement windows. The property is at 140 Oak St and is in the Historic District.

looks good

Eric Gray's move to appropriate, Bobby second
all unanimous approved

- 3. ARB consideration of Bryan and Kendell Stange application for construction of a new single-family home with 1,900 heated square feet. The property is at 153 Tarbell Lane and is in the Historic District.

Mary D - move to approve as drawn and changes

- 4. ARB consideration of Patrick and Heidi Smith application for rear porch alterations (enclosing rear porch and adding around 200 sq feet for bathroom), as well as the addition of a porch on the Creekside façade of the home. All windows will be wood and 6 over 6 like originals. Roof will be metal. The property is at 211 Rutledge Court and is in the Historic District.

discussion - Tammy 2nd He wants to come back next meeting as pre-application. Mary w/draw Tammy, Bobby second

- 5. ARB consideration of Derek Mulkey of Distinctive Stone application is for addition of an exterior stone fireplace on back right corner of home with firebox opening from kitchen level and the required clearance from the roof line. The property is at 642 Thomas Pinckney Court and is in the Historic District.

ask to table After seeing examples

- 6. Other Business

motion to

- 7. Adjournment

Tammy
Mary all in favor

9:20 PM

Tammy moved to open

Mayor
Rutledge B. Leland, III

Town Council
Aaron L. Baldwin
Christopher B. Bates
Robert J. Gannon
James E. Scott, IV



Town Clerk/Treasurer
Michelle A. McClellan

Municipal Judge
Gail Guzzo

Zoning Administrator
Kathryn S. Basha

Phone: (843) 887-3712

405 Pinckney Street
McClellanville, S.C. 29458

FAX: (843) 887-3094

MEMO

To: McClellanville Architectural Review Board
From: Kathryn S Basha AICP, Zoning Administrator
Date: January 19, 2021
Re: Window Replacement, 140 Oak Street, TMS 764-14-00-067

The property owner of 140 Oak Street has applied for the replacement of original wood windows with new vinyl windows. This property is in the local historic district, on Oak Street. This home was built in c.1904 per the 2007 Historic Survey and is listed as a contributing property to the historic district. It was historically owned by members of the Graham family. The structure is highly visible from the roadway and from other contributing structures in the District.

The adopted guidelines direct the ARB to apply the Fenestration guidelines outlined in the Town's Design Guidebook to ensure the new windows are harmonious with the contributing structure and other contributing structures in the Village by giving consideration to the following guidelines:

- 1. Fenestration:** *It is beneficial and encouraged to repair windows, which retain as much historic fabric as possible, in lieu of replacing windows on contributing buildings. Where replacement windows are necessary they should match the material and configuration of the original windows. Simulated divided-lite windows and windows constructed of materials such as aluminum and vinyl are not acceptable on contributing buildings. True divided lights and muntins with an exterior profile comparable to contributing buildings of a similar architectural style are acceptable in new construction or noncontributing buildings.*

Original door and window details, such as transoms, sidelights, framing, sills, dormers, shutters, and lintels should be retained, and when necessary repaired or replaced with materials that match the original in appearance, texture, dimensions, or scale...Storm windows and doors must fit within the framework of the original trim and be painted to match the window trim. It is inharmonious to lower, enlarge, or otherwise alter the size of window or door openings of a historic building.

Original door and window openings on a building façade should be retained whenever possible. The size of existing historic window openings should not be altered. If replacement is necessary, replacement windows should be of a design (2/2, 6/6, 9/9, double hung) and material similar to the original. Alternative materials may be acceptable if they have a painted finish. Aluminum or vinyl clad replacement windows are acceptable for nonconforming buildings and new construction.

Staff's observation is that the existing windows appear to be the original, wood windows with wavy glass. Staff did not see any broken glass panes or rotten wood on the front façade windows. Windows are of various sizes, yet the majority or all are one over one configuration. If any broken panes do exist or if there are portions of rotten wood in the windows, the Design Manual states these windows should be repaired, not replaced. In the event that windows are replaced, removal should not permanently destroy surrounding elements of the structure and replacement windows should be of the same configuration as well as having similar framing to the original windows. The Manual specifically calls out vinyl windows as not appropriate for contributing structures.

Staff research subsequent to the October meeting found that there is precedent for ARB approval of vinyl clad (wood) replacement windows for contributing structures. Staff has confirmed that the proposed windows are vinyl clad and have the same configuration as existing windows. Likewise, the applicant has provided photos (attached) to demonstrate that dimensions of the proposed windows' framing are comparable to the original windows and that the windows will be replaced from the inside such that the exterior trim is not removed. In the event that a window must be replaced from the exterior, the original trim will be reinstalled or replaced with a like material.

The owner has been trying to have one window, not visible to the public, replaced so that the ARB can see how installation will not impact the exterior profile and/or trim of the window or structure siding. The plan is for this installation to be done so pictures can be sent to the ARB prior to the meeting.

Zoning Considerations:

The only zoning provisions applicable to this project are the historic district review requirements and criteria. The fact that the windows have already been purchased prior to obtaining ARB/zoning approval should NOT be a factor in considering this application.

Staff Recommendation:

Standards for contributing buildings in the Design Review Manual follow the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Historic Buildings. Consistent deviations from those standards can not only compromise designation of an individual structure as "contributing", but also can jeopardize the Town's designation as a Certified Local Government with the State Historic Preservation Office. Therefore, Staff does not recommend deviations from the standards unless there are no other options and wants the owner to be clear that such deviation does put the structure at risk to lose its historic designation.

The Commission should therefore determine if the proposed vinyl clad windows are appropriate for a contributing structure, while considering the potential negative consequences that could result to its status as a contributing structure if the windows are approved.

In the event that the Commission makes that determination, Staff recommends approval be conditioned upon:

1. Windows visible from the public right of way will be replaced ONLY if no other option exists to ensure windows are able to provide protection of the interior from natural elements.
2. All replacement windows will be installed from the house interior;
3. Where there is no other option than to remove exterior trim to replace the windows, original trim shall be re-installed or replaced with trim comparable in material and dimension;

Minutes

McClellanville Architectural / Design Review Board

January 19, 2021 — 7:00 PM

The McClellanville Architectural Review Board/Design Review Board met on the above noted time and date. The time and date of the meeting had been advertised in compliance with state law. Members of the public present at the meeting: Derek Mulkey, Dr. Bednar, Bryan Stange, Marc Sigmon, Patrick and Heidi Smith, Benny Marshall, and the representative of Window World. Board members present Mary Duke, Tammy Huggins, Bobby Wilson, and Eric Craig. Town Staff members present: Austin Rutherford, Kathryn Basha, and Natalie Lewis

Meeting was called to order by Tammy Huggins who read the purpose of the board, "*The purpose of the McClellanville Architectural Review Board is to ensure that the historic integrity of significant or contributing properties is preserved so that the integrity of the village's historic character is not compromised.*"

The Board reviewed minutes from November/December combined meeting on December 8, 2020 meeting. Mary Duke motioned to approve minutes as written and Bobby Wilson seconded. Minutes were unanimously approved.

Tammy Huggins made a motion to rediscuss 140 Oak Street in the Historic District this application was tabled at the October 2020 meeting. This application is for consideration of 28 replacement windows. After discussion of the 1 new window installed on side of home, Eric Craig moved to approve as submitted and Bobby Wilson seconded motion, it was unanimously approved.

Tammy Huggins made a motion to discuss 153 Tarbell Lane in the Historic District. This application is for a 1,900 heated square foot new single-family home. After discussion Mary Duke moved to approve with changes discussed and Tammy Huggins seconded motion. Applicant asked to come back to board next month to have changes approved with new drawings of changes discussed with board. Mary withdrew her motion, and applicant will return at February meeting with final drawings. Tammy motioned to approve January as the pre-application for 153 Tarbell Lane and hear final application in February, Bobby Wilson seconded motion and it was unanimously approved.

Tammy Huggins made a motion to discuss 211 Rutledge Court in the Historic District. This application is for enclosing rear porch and add around 200 sq feet for a bathroom with a porch addition on the Creekside of home. All windows will be wood for those that need to be replaced and for new windows added, all will be 6 over 6 like originals. Roof will be metal, either 5V crimp or standing seam, and siding will be the same as currently on home. Foundation for addition will be brick to match current foundation. After discussion Tammy Huggins made a motion to approved as submitted. Eric Craig seconded motion; it was unanimously approved.

Tammy Huggins made a motion to rediscuss 642 Thomas Pinckney Court which is in the Historic District. This application was tabled from December meeting and is from Derek Mulkey of Distinctive Stone. It is for approval of adding an exterior stone fireplace on back right corner of home with firebox opening from kitchen level and the required clearance from the roof line. Dr. Bednar informed board of his knowledge of art and area history and he asked board to think about diversifying the village by allowing stone to be added. After discussion of materials that have been used in Town and options that could be use instead of stone Dr.

Bednar asked if Derek Mulkey could come back next month with images of examples he has installed to show it will be visually appealing to board. Tammy Huggins made a motion to table application until February meeting to see examples that Mr. Mulkey has created from other areas. Mary Duke seconded motion, it was unanimously approved.

Meeting was adjourned at 9:20 PM

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Natalie L." followed by a horizontal flourish.

Respectfully submitted,

Natalie Lewis/ Secretary

**THE ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
OF THE TOWN OF McCLELLANVILLE
CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**

APPLICANT: Window World, representng Benny Marshall

SITE ADDRESS: 140 Oak St

NATURE OF APPLICATION:
for consideration of 28 replacement windows.

CONDITIONS IMPOSED BY THE ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD

Install from interior, retain existing trim
Retain original windows for future owners use.

This CERTIFICATE acknowledges that this application to the Architectural Review Board has been determined to be appropriate and in keeping with the historic and prevailing architectural qualities of the Historic District. This CERTIFICATE is awarded subject to strict adherence to the above conditions and conformance with your presentation to the Board. This CERTIFICATE should not be construed as a Zoning Permit or Building Permit. All permits, licenses, and fees must be secured after award of this CERTIFICATE.

11/9/2021
Date

Jimmy L. Hussius
Chair, Architectural Review Board

cc: Mayor and Town Council

PROPERTY ADDRESS: 140 oak St

TMS# 164-14-00-067

Applicant name(s) (Print): Harley Port

Describe scope of work proposed for property:

28 window Replacement
Vinyl Window Replacement - 1 picture, 27 double hung
No divided lights

Proposed Lot Coverage: _____ Proposed Use: _____

Set Backs (feet): Front _____ Left _____ Right _____ Rear _____

Residential Floor Area (sq feet heated) _____ Porches/other (sq. feet unheated) _____

Building Height (feet above base flood elevation): _____

Zoning Administrator Review:

New window replacement approved as option
by ARB on 01/19/2021.

Approved

Approved with conditions

Disapproved

Date: 02/22/2021

[Signature] for Kathryn Baska

Zoning Administrator